



# SOUTH AFRICAN JUDICIAL EDUCATION JOURNAL

VOLUME 6, ISSUE 1, 2023



**10** YEARS  
2011 - 2021

**SAJEI**  
South African Judicial Education  
Institute  
*Enhancing Judicial Excellence*



# **SOUTH AFRICAN JUDICIAL EDUCATION JOURNAL**

VOLUME 6, ISSUE 1, 2023



This journal is published under the auspices  
of the South African Judicial Education Institute.

Published: July 2025

ISSN: 2616-7999

© South African Judicial Education Institute  
Office of the Chief Justice, 188 14th Road, Noordwyk, Midrand, 1687

*This book is copyright under the Berne Convention. In terms of the Copyright Act 98 of 1978, no part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the SAJEI.*

## TRIBUTE TO AKHO NTANJANA



Why should young and promising eagles suddenly perish and be taken away from us forever? I am gutted and unable to understand why.

Akho Ntanjana was on a meteoric rise – he was excelling in his career and slowly transforming into a trailblazer in his own unique way. He was a quiet, focused, forward looking young man and destined to reach great heights.

Akho worked tirelessly on the accreditation of this journal by the Department of Higher Education and Training – a long and arduous process. The receipt of the accreditation letter made him smile – he was relieved and fulfilled when he achieved his objective. He reminded us all that the real work was about to begin to maintain the accreditation.

Akho will be sorely missed by his SAJEI colleagues, the SAJEI Editorial Board members, the authors, the JUTA team and, more specifically, by his mother, wife, and siblings. May his soul rest in peace and rise in glory.

DR GOMOLEMO MOSHOEU

*Production editor*

Well done, Akho!

You have run your race; now, it is for us to take the baton  
and continue on your well-defined route.

*Thank you for being our guiding light.*



## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

A Closer Look at the Reviews and Appeals in South Africa <i>Justice John Eldrid Smith</i> .....	1
Addressing sentencing disparities in Nigeria through the implementation of sentencing guidelines: A model for reform in South Africa <i>Mr Polycarp Chibueze Okorie Esq</i> .....	29
'Less severe alternative' in the context of private defence: Is there a need for a clear roadmap? <i>Mr Boyane Tshehla</i> .....	50
The challenges faced by lecturers and students during Eskom's load shedding: a research based on the experiences in higher education in South Africa <i>Adv Themba Mathebula</i> .....	62
Upholding judicial independence: A critical review of the executive conduct in Malawi <i>Justice Redson Edward Kapindu</i> .....	83

### CASE NOTES

An attempt by a trade union to ignore its own constitution, a discussion of: <i>National Union of Metal Workers of South Africa v Lufil Packaging (isithebe)</i> (2020) 41 ILJ 1846 (CC) and <i>Afgri Animal Feeds (a division of PhilAfrica Foods</i> <i>(Pty) Limited) v National Union of Metalworkers South Africa and others</i> [2024] ZACC 13 <i>Dr Fanelesibonge Mabaso</i> .....	105
An examination of the employee's right to strike and repercussions for participating in an unprotected strike as demonstrated in the case of <i>Ngobeni v Interspray Durban</i> (JS739-18) [2024] ZALCJHB 80 (21 February 2024) <i>Mr Thukwe Solly Mmakola, Adv Lufuno Tokyo Nevondwe and</i> <i>Mr Konanani Happy Raligilia</i> .....	119
Automatic rehabilitation, not so automatic: <i>Engelbrecht No v Naidoo</i> [2023] ZAGPJHC 866 (3 August 2023) <i>Dr Zingapi Mabe and Prof André Boraine</i> .....	133
The concurrence of actions tug of war continues: <i>Trio Engineering</i> <i>Products Inc v Pilot Crushtec International (Pty) Ltd</i> [2019] JOL 41120 (GJ) <i>Adv Mark Morgan</i> .....	156
The deferment of payment of beneficiary claim pending the outcome third party investigative processes: A review of <i>Ncube v Liberty Life</i> [2024] 2 LL SA 861 (GJ) and <i>Basdeo v Discovery Life Ltd</i> [2024] ZAGPPHC 884 (10 September 2024) <i>Prof Tumo Charles Maloka and Mr Thiruneson Padayachy</i> .....	168

Reinforcing water governance through purposive interpretation: A Commentary on <i>Minister of Water and Sanitation and Others v Lotter No and Others; Minister of Water and Sanitation and Others v Wiid and Others; Minister of Water and Sanitation v South African Association for Water Users' Associations</i> (CCT 387/21) [2023] ZACC 9; 2023 (6) BCLR 763 (CC); 2023 (4) SA 434 (CC) (15 March 2023) <i>Prof Dejo Olowu</i> .....	179
--	-----

## **GREAT REFLECTIONS IN CELEBRATION OF 100 YEARS OF WOMEN IN LAW**

<i>100 Years Of Women in Law In South Africa – A Century of (Slow) Progress and Change for Women in the Practice of Law</i> <i>Adv Sesi Baloyi (SC)</i> .....	191
<i>A Life of Purpose</i> <i>Ms Hlaleleni Kathleen Matolo-Dlepu</i> .....	194

## **BOOK REVIEWS**

<i>Applied Military Justice for Practitioners</i> (Michelle Nel, Sonja Els and Vukile Sibiyi) by Dr Arthur van Coller.....	197
<i>Constitutional Review of the Republic of Namibia</i> (Sakeus Akweenda) by Dr Ntandokayise Ndlovu and Dr Arthur van Coller.....	200
<i>Employment Rights</i> (John Grogan) by Dr Kim-Leigh Loedolf .....	203
<i>Labour Litigation and Dispute Resolution</i> (John Grogan) by Ms Katlego Mmakosha Mthelebofu .....	205
<i>Medico-legal Aspects of Cerebral Palsy – A Handbook for Legal and Healthcare Practitioners</i> (Ravin Kumar Ramdass) by Mr Daniel Humpel.....	210
<i>Sexual Harassment in South Africa: A critical analysis of vicarious liability of an employer</i> (Yondela Ndema) by Dr Yvonne Jooste .....	212
<i>The Development of SADC Community Law in Member States</i> (MR Phooko, LT Chigowe and H 'Nyane) by Dr Tinyiko Ngobeni.....	214
<b>EDITORIAL POLICY</b> .....	219
<b>NOTES TO PROSPECTIVE AUTHORS AND CONTRIBUTORS</b> .....	223



*Enhancing Judicial Excellence*

**188 14th Road, Noordwyk, Midrand, 1687**

**Private Bag X10, Marshalltown, 2000**

---

The *South African Judicial Education Journal* is published by the South African Judicial Education Institute (SAJEI), Office of the Chief Justice. The mandate of SAJEI is to provide judicial education to aspiring and serving Judicial Officers in order to enhance judicial accountability and transformation of the Judiciary.

The journal is intended to consist of contributions, articles, case notes and book reviews. The views expressed by the authors or contributors do not reflect the views of SAJEI and Editorial Board.

The Editorial Board invites unsolicited articles on topical issues relating to judicial education and the Judiciary. It may, in its discretion, accept articles that do not strictly deal with judicial education. The Editorial Board reserves the right to edit articles and circulate for double-blind peer review.

This journal is accredited by the Department of Higher Education and Training.

Currently, the journal is not for sale. Requests for PDF electronic copies should be sent to [SAJEJ@judiciary.org.za](mailto:SAJEJ@judiciary.org.za).



## EDITORIAL BOARD

### **Editor-in-Chief**

Judge Dennis M Davis

*Judge President of the Competition Appeal Court (retired), and Professor at the University of Cape Town*

### **Managing editor**

Judge President Cagney Musi

*Free State Division of the High Court of South Africa*

### **Production editor**

Dr Gomolemo Moshoeu

*Chief Executive Officer, South African Judicial Education Institute*

### **Board members**

Justice Tati Makgoka

*Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa*

Judge Mpopelele Bruce Langa

*Mpumalanga Division of the High Court of South Africa*

Mr Mohammed Randera

*Attorney of the High Court, Republic of South Africa*

Prof Letlhokwa George Mpedi

*Vice Chancellor, University of Johannesburg, South Africa*

Prof Managay Reddi

*Dean of the Faculty of Law, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa*

Mr Gerhard van Rooyen

*Magistrate of the District Court, Emlazi, KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa*

## ADVISORY PANEL

President MB Molemela

*Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa*

Justice OL Rogers

*Constitutional Court of South Africa*

Justice CME O'Regan (retired)

*Constitutional Court of South Africa*

Justice E Cameron (retired)

*Constitutional Court of South Africa*

Judge President SM Mbenenge

*Eastern Cape Division of the High Court of South Africa*

Judge A Govindjee

*Eastern Cape Division of the High Court of South Africa*

Prof C Albertyn

*University of the Witwatersrand*

Prof PE Andrews

*University of Cape Town*

Prof R Kruger

*Rhodes University*

Prof CMA Nicholson

*University of the Free State*

Prof N Ntlama

*University of Fort Hare*

Prof OS Sibanda

*University of Limpopo*

Prof A Lansink

*University of Venda*

Dr N Lubisi

*University of Fort Hare*

---

***Employment Rights***

by John Grogan

Fourth Edition. Juta. 2024

---

The book takes the reader on a journey by looking at pre-employment rights, employment and to some extent, post-employment rights. *Employment Rights* also discusses, at length, the legislative framework, case law, policies and codes applicable to the before-mentioned stages of employment.

The book not only reflects the current state of rights, and legal developments in this space with great accuracy, but the reader is also privy to historical developments leading up to current rights. The book will be most valuable to legal scholars at advanced levels of study and exceptionally valuable to legal practitioners as well as other informed persons who take an interest in the subject matter. The chapter layout and overall structure of the book, allow for easy reading and learning and will hence be useful to law teachers who may wish to use this book as a teaching resource. The writing style is clear and concise which makes for easy and enjoyable reading.

*Employment Rights*, is a comprehensive and authoritative resource, providing an in-depth analysis of the legal framework governing employer-employee relations. The book is meticulously structured, making it a valuable resource for legal scholars, practitioners, and students seeking a thorough understanding of employment law.

One of the book's strengths lies in its clarity and accessibility. The author presents complex legal concepts in a structured manner, using precise language which balances academic rigour with readability. Each chapter is well-organised, beginning with an overview of key principles before delving into detailed discussions supported by case law and statutory references.

Overall, the book is an essential addition to the field of employment law. Its clarity, depth, and contemporary analysis make it a highly recommended resource for both academic and professional audiences.

There are no shortcomings to the book in my view. The author may have already included some of these suggestions below in other works.

The following represents some suggestions, perhaps to be considered for future editions:

- The book is suitable for readers with some legal knowledge and a novice would read it with some difficulty. With that said, the targeted audience is likely those who have a legal background, perhaps students in their second or third year of study.
- The book is not a textbook, but it will be used, undeniably as a teaching and study resource. The author might wish to consider some pedagogical features, including case studies, discussion questions,

and summary tables which aid comprehension. These elements are particularly beneficial for students, enabling them to critically engage with the material and apply legal principles to real-world scenarios.

- A potential enrichment to the book would be to include evolving issues in employment law, such as remote work regulations, and employee data protection.
- The inclusion of international comparisons could further enhance the book's utility, particularly when drawing insights from comparative legal frameworks.

I commend the author on an excellent job. *Employment Rights* is a standout contribution in the domain of labour law.

DR KIM-LEIGH LOEDOLF

*Associate Lecturer, ASLJ editor  
University of the Western Cape*